

Unconfirmed Meeting Minutes:
IEEE 802.3 Improved PTP Timestamping Accuracy (ITSA) Study Group

November 13, 2019
Waikoloa, HI, USA

Prepared by Dino Pozzebon

IEEE 802.3 Improving PTP Timestamping Accuracy Study Group meeting convened at 8:00 AM, Wednesday November 13, 2019 by Steve Gorshe, ITSA SG Chair.

Chair opened the meeting and started presenting [Agenda and General Information](#).

Agenda was reviewed and approved.

The Chair then resumed presenting

Study Group Decorum - Chair reviewed slide and noted that there should be no recording or photography without permission. Chair asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting – none responded.

Previous meeting minutes were reviewed with chair asking attendees if there were any questions, comments or changes requested. None were requested.

Chairs asked for motion to approve the previous meeting minutes.

Motion #1: Approve minutes from the previous meeting [Meeting Minutes](#), Sept. 12, 2019 Indianapolis, IN U.S.A.

Approved by voice vote without objection (Procedural > 50%)

Goals for Meeting – Chair presented the goals for the meeting was to review the received feedback from the 802 Working Groups regarding the Task Force objectives, PAR, CSD (5 Criteria). There was no discussion on the goals.

Big Ticket Items – Chair presented the Big-Ticket items for this meeting would be to review feedback and update PAR if required.

Reflector and Web – Chair presented the study groups reflector and web information. All in attendance were invited to subscribe for study group communications and updates.

Ground Rules – Chair review the meeting ground rules based on IEEE 802.3 Rules.

IEEE Structure, bylaws & misc – Chair review the IEEE SA structure including a review of how 802.3 WG and the study group is located within the structure. The important bylaws and rules were pointed out for all to refer if needed or of interest. Guidelines for IEEE SA meeting were reviewed with the

chair reading out the top of page bullets on the slide. Chair invited study group to reference to links at bottom of slide for more information regarding the page's bullets. Chair also reviewed the IEEE 802 Participation slide reminding all in attendance that participation was on an individual basis, based on qualifications or experience. No comments were collected from those in attendance regarding any of this latter presented material.

Overview of IEEE802.3 Standards Process – Chair reviewed the standards process slides and reminded the study group where in the process this study group was (see You are here on slide 1 of 5).

The Study Group – Chair presented a high-level summary of an IEEE SA study group's purpose, duration and expectations.

ITSA Study Group Objectives – Chair reviewed the objectives adopted in September 2019 for this Study Group

Liaisons - The Chair moved to Liaisons and noted that there were no liaisons for the Study Group at this time.

Action Items - The Chair moved to Action Items and noted that there were no actions for the Study Group at this time.

Attendance - Chair advised the group of the IEEE meeting attendance tool and procedures, including both the attendance sheet and the web attendance tracking tool. Attendance is listed in Appendix A.

Presentation list – The chair outlined the list of presentations to be review during the meeting. All presentations are available at [November 2019, Waikoloa, HI, USA](#).

Presentations

802.1 Group's comments related to PAR/CSD/Objectives - [Comments from 802.1](#)

The first PAR comment on slide #2 of the presentation was presented. Comment suggested altering "in support of" to "with the target being" the ITU-T listed specifications. The study group felt that this comment should be rejected because the listed ITU-T specifications are system level specifications and that 802.3 standards are responsible for a portion of the overall system targeted by those specifications. The study group also reiterated that the group will not be specifying a numerical value for PHY latency or delay but instead a means by which a PHY may report a latency or delay such that the overall system specification can be evaluated.

Motion #2: Motion to reject the 802.1 PAR feedback from Slide 2 captured as "Define optional enhancements to Ethernet support for time synchronization protocols to provide improved timestamp accuracy ~~in support of~~ with the target being, ITU-T Recommendation G.8273.2 'Class C' and 'Class D' system time error

performance requirements.” with the reason being those ITU specification are system level specifications with 802.3 PHY layer being a small portion of the overall timing budget for these specifications.

Technical (>=75%)

Moved by: Marek Hajduczenia

Seconded by: Bill Powell

Y: 13 N: 0 A: 0

MOTION PASSES (>= 75%)

The remaining comments on slides 3 and 4 were reviewed.

- Slide 3 PAR comment to add ITU-T G.8275.1 to section 8.1 of PAR (as outlined in section 5.2b of PAR) had no discussion.
- Slide 4 CSD Broad Market Potential comment regarding removal of reference to high-rate interface was deemed acceptable since the eventual task force work would be PHY rate agnostic and the specification would not target specific PHY rates.
- Slide 4 CSD Compatibility comment regarding a typo was acknowledged and deemed appropriate.

Motion #3: Motion to accept 802.1 feedback on slides 3 and 4 of [Comments from 802.1](#) presentation.

Technical (>=75%)

Moved by: Marek Hajduczenia

Seconded by: Clark Carty

Y: 11 N: 0 A: 0

MOTION PASSES (>= 75%)

802.11 Group's comments related to PAR/CSD/Objectives - [Comments from 802.11](#)

The comment on slide 6 was reviewed, acknowledged and deemed appropriate. No vote was required to accept this change since it was a Minor Nit.

FUTURE MEETINGS

Chair reviewed future meetings locations from the agenda presentation and asked for a show of hands on potential study group attendance at those meetings.

January (Geneva)

- I will attend the Study Group / Task Force meeting: 6
- I may attend the Study Group / Task Force meeting: 5
- I will not attend the Study Group / Task Force meeting: 3

March (Atlanta)

- I will attend the Study Group / Task Force meeting: 10
- I may attend the Study Group / Task Force meeting: 3
- I will not attend the Study Group / Task Force meeting: 2

Adjournment

Motion #6: To adjourn the meeting

(Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes by Voice without Opposition

Appendix A - Attendance

IEEE 802.3 Improving PTP Timestamping Accuracy SG IEEE 802.3 Plenary November 2019				Day 1 Nov. 11	Day 2 Nov. 12	Day 3 Nov. 13	Day 4 Nov. 14	16
By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.								
Last Name	First Name	Employer	Affiliations	Mon	Tues	Wed	Thurs	his mee
Anslow	Pete	Ciena	Ciena					0
Aranda	Perez	KDPOF	KDPOF					0
Bordogna	Mark	Intel	Intel			x		1
Bruckman	Leon	Huawei	Huawei					0
Butter	Adrian	Avera Semi	Avera Semi					0
Carty	Clark	Cisco	Cisco			x		1
Chalupsky	David	Intel	Intel			x		1
Cheng	Weiyang	Infinera	Infinera			x		1
Chuang	Keng Hua	HPE	HPE			x		1
Cummings	Rodney	National Instruments	National Instruments			x		1
Dambrosia	John	Futurewei	Futurewei (U.S. subsidiary of Huawei)					0
Gorshe	Steve	Microchip	Microchip			x		1
Grow	Robert	RMG Consulting	RMG Consulting, KDPOF					0
Hajduczenia	Marek	Charter	Charter			x		1
Lapak	Jeff		UNH-IOL			x		1
Laubach	Mark	Broadcom	Broadcom					0
Law	David	HPE	HPE					0
Lee	Sylvanus	Leviton	Leviton					0
Lennartsson		Kvaser AB	Kvaser AB			x		1
Maki	Jeffery	Juniper Networks	Juniper					0
Maniloff	Eric	Ciena	Ciena					0
McMillan	Larry	Western Digital	Western Digital					0
Nowell	Mark	Cisco	Cisco					0
Ofelt	David	Juniper Networks	Juniper					0
Pittala	Fabio	Huawei	Huawei					0
Powell	Bill	Nokia	Nokia			x		1
Pozzebon	Dino	Microchip	Microchip			x		1
Shah	Anup	Mentor Graphics	Mentor Graphics			x		1
Sprague	Ted	Infinera	Infinera					0
Stassar	Peter	Huawei	Huawei					0
Takefman	Michael	Inphi	Inphi			x		1
Trowbridge	Steve	Nokia	Nokia					0
Tse	Richard	Microchip	Microchip					0
Tseng	Tachzu	Real Tek	Real Tek			x		1
Wang	Roy	HPE	HPE			x		1

